

# Journal of the Indian Law Institute

---

VOLUME 56

JANUARY-MARCH 2014

NUMBER 1

---

## CONTENTS

Contribution of Shri Motilal Nehru to The Legal Profession	... P. Sathasivam	1
<b>ARTICLES</b>		
Chhatrapati Singh and the Idea of a Legal Theory	... Upendra Baxi	5
Citizen's Right to Vote: Role of the Supreme Court in Empowering Citizenry to bring about 'A Systemic Change' through NOTA for Cleansing our body politic (A Juristic Critique of Constitutional Developments)	... Virendra Kumar	25
Right to Food: International and National Perspectives	... Manoj Kumar Sinha	47
Medical Tourism, Surrogacy & the Legal Overtones - The Indian Tale	... Diksha Munjal-Shankar	62
<b>NOTES AND COMMENTS</b>		
Slippery Slopes of Compensatory Tax and Fee	... Neha Patbakeji	78
India's Treaty Practice in Climate Change	... Anwar Sadat	95
<b>BOOK REVIEWS</b>		
Oliver Mendelsohn, <i>Law and Social Transformation</i>	... Ranbir Singh	106
A. G. Noorani, <i>Challenges to Civil Rights Guarantees in India</i>	... P. Puneeth	110
BOOKS RECEIVED FOR REVIEW	.....	118
LIST OF FOREIGN ARTICLES	.....	120
LIST OF SELECT FOREIGN CASES	.....	139

---

Information regarding non-receipt of the Journal and other matters, should be addressed to the Registrar, The Indian Law Institute, Bhagwan Dass Road, New Delhi-110001. Phones: +91-11-23387526, Fax: +91-11-23782140, E-mail: ili@ili.ac.in Website: www.ilidelhi.org and www.ili.ac.in

---

**Cite this volume as 56 JILI (2014)**

---

The *Journal of the Indian Law Institute* is a quarterly publication. Papers for publication in this *Journal* are invited in the form of articles, notes and case comments. The paper must contain an abstract in not more than 150 words. The mode of citation and footnoting should be as followed in this Issue. Papers already published elsewhere will not be considered for publication in this *Journal*, Paper should be typed in double space on one side of the A-4 size paper is sent in compact disc (CD) or as an attachment with e-mail at [ili@ili.ac.in](mailto:ili@ili.ac.in)

The Indian Law Institute shall be the sole copyright owner of all the published materials. Apart from fair dealing for the purposes of research, private study or criticism, no part of this *Journal* be copied, adapted, abridged, translated or stored in any retrieval system, computer system, photographic or other system or reproduced in any form by any means whether electronic, mechanical, digital, optical, photographic or otherwise without prior written permission from the Institute.

The editors, publishers and printers do not own any responsibility for the views expressed by the contributors and for the errors, if any, in the information contained in the *Journal* and author shall be solely responsible for the same.

---

# Journal of the Indian Law Institute

---

VOLUME 56

APRIL-JUNE 2014

NUMBER 2

---

## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

Child Labour: Should Companies ‘Stand at Bay’ or ‘Enter the Water’?	... <i>Surya Deva</i>	143
Right to free Speech and Censorship: A Jurisprudential Analysis	... <i>Shameek Sen</i>	175
Judicial Independence and Its Guarantees beyond the Nation State - Some Recent Hungarian Experience	... <i>Attila Vincze</i>	202

### NOTES AND COMMANDS

Regulating Health Related Technologies and Medical Devices: with Special Reference to India	... <i>N.K. Chakrabarti</i> ... <i>Shreya Chatterjee</i>	216
Taxing ‘Service’: Jurisdictional Issues	... <i>Sujit Kumar Sinha</i>	236

### BOOK REVIEW

V.R.Krishna Iyer. <i>The Constitution Corruption Pathological Casualties and Radical Remedies Reformatories</i>	... <i>Vinod Dixit</i>	250
S.N. Aggarwal, Supreme Court Asserts as Conscience Keeper of the Constitution of India	... <i>Beant Singh Bedi*</i>	256
N.S. Gopalakrishnan and T.G. Agitha, Principles of Intellectual Property	... <i>Indranath Gupta</i>	262
BOOKS RECEIVED FOR REVIEW	...	271
LIST OF FOREIGN ARTICLES	...	273
LIST OF SELECT FOREIGN CASES	...	301

---

Information regarding non-receipt of the Journal and other matters, should be addressed to the Registrar, The Indian Law Institute, Bhagwan Dass Road, New Delhi-110001. Phones: +91-11-23387526, Fax: +91-11-23782140, E-mail:ili@ili.ac.in Website:www.ilidelhi.org and www.ili.ac.in

---

**Cite this volume as 56 JILI (2014)**

---

The *Journal of the Indian Law Institute* is a quarterly publication. Papers for publication in this *Journal* are invited in the form of articles, notes and case comments. The paper must contain an abstract in not more than 150 words. The mode of citation and footnoting should be as followed in this Issue. Papers already published elsewhere will not be considered for publication in this *Journal*, Paper should be typed in double space on one side of the A-4 size paper and sent in compact disc (CD) or as an attachment with e-mail at [ili@ili.ac.in](mailto:ili@ili.ac.in)

The Indian Law Institute shall be the sole copyright owner of all the published materials. Apart from fair dealing for the purposes of research, private study or criticism, no part of this *Journal* be copied, adapted, abridged, translated or stored in any retrieval system, computer system, photographic or other system or reproduced in any form by any means whether electronic, mechanical, digital, optical, photographic or otherwise without prior written permission from the Institute.

The editors, publishers and printers do not own any responsibility for the views expressed by the contributors and for the errors, if any, in the information contained in the *Journal* and author shall be solely responsible for the same.

---

# Journal of the Indian Law Institute

---

VOLUME 56

JULY-SEPTEMBER 2014

NUMBER 3

---

## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- Juvenile Justice Bill 2014 – A Regressive Step . . . *Ved Kumari* 303
- Combating Piracy under the United Nations  
Convention on the Law of the Sea 1982 . . . *Abdul Haseeb Ansari* 320  
. . . *Kyaw Hla Win*  
. . . *Abdul Ghafur Hamid*
- Water Management in the Age of Decolonization:  
An Account of the Ganges and Teesta Water  
Dispute in South Asia . . . *Bikramjit De* 348

### NOTES AND COMMENTS

- Arriving at a Settlement Under Family Courts  
Act, 1984: Deconstructing the Role of the Judge  
of the Family Court and Counselor . . . *Daniel Mathew* 376
- International Human Rights Law: Responsibility  
of Non-State Actors for Acts of Terrorism . . . *Shruti Bedi* 386
- Supreme Court and the Domestic Violence Act:  
A Critical Comment on *Indra Sarma v.*  
*V.K.V. Sarma* . . . *Anupama Goel* 398

### BOOK REVIEW

- Ritu Gupta. *Sexual Harassment at Workplace (2014)* . . . *Manjula Batra* 407

BOOKS RECEIVED FOR REVIEW . . . 412

LIST OF FOREIGN ARTICLES . . . 413

LIST OF SELECT FOREIGN CASES . . . 433

---

Information regarding non-receipt of the Journal and other matters, should be addressed to the Registrar, The Indian Law Institute, Bhagwan Dass Road, New Delhi-110001. Phones: +91-11-23387526, Fax: +91-11-23782140, E-mail:ili@ili.ac.in Website:www.ilidelhi.org and www.ili.ac.in

---

**Cite this volume as 56 JILI (2014)**

---

The *Journal of the Indian Law Institute* is a quarterly publication. Papers for publication in this *Journal* are invited in the form of articles, notes and case comments. The paper must contain an abstract in not more than 150 words. The mode of citation and footnoting should be as followed in this Issue. Papers already published elsewhere will not be considered for publication in this *Journal*, Paper should be typed in double space on one side of the A-4 size paper and also sent in compact disc (CD) or as an attachment with e-mail at [ili@ili.ac.in](mailto:ili@ili.ac.in)

The Indian Law Institute shall be the sole copyright owner of all the published materials. Apart from fair dealing for the purposes of research, private study or criticism, no part of this *Journal* be copied, adapted, abridged, translated or stored in any retrieval system, computer system, photographic or other system or reproduced in any form by any means whether electronic, mechanical, digital, optical, photographic or otherwise without prior written permission from the Institute.

The editors, publishers and printers do not own any responsibility for the views expressed by the contributors and for the errors, if any, in the information contained in the *Journal* and author shall be solely responsible for the same.

---

# Journal of the Indian Law Institute

---

VOLUME 56

OCTOBER-DECEMBER 2014

NUMBER 4

---

## CONTENTS

### ARTICLES

- Corporate Governance: A Sojourn to find a Yardstick . . . *N.L. Mitra* 437
- Public Participation in Environmental Clearances in India: Prospects for Democratic Decision-making . . . *NaveenThayyil* 463
- Death of a Discipline: Locating Heterodoxy in Law . . . *Yugank Goyal* 493

### NOTES AND COMMENTS

- Older Persons and the International Human Rights Framework: Argument for a Specific International Convention . . . *Mallika Ramachandran* 523
- India and Nuclear Disarmament: A Discussion in light of the Application by The Republic of the Marshall Islands before the International Court of Justice . . . *Rukmini Das & Shubhangi Bhadada* 550
- Human Trafficking, Justice Verma Committee Report and Legal Reform: An Unaccomplished Agenda . . . *Sarfaraz Ahmed Khan* 560

### BOOK REVIEW

- Geetanjoy Sahu, *Environmental Jurisprudence and The Supreme Court (2014)* . . . *Furqan Ahmad* 574

LIST OF FOREIGN ARTICLES . . . 578

LIST OF SELECT FOREIGN CASES . . . 597

---

Information regarding non-receipt of the Journal and other matters, should be addressed to the Registrar, The Indian Law Institute, Bhagwan Dass Road, New Delhi-110001. Phone: +91-11-23387526, Fax: +91-11-23782140, E-mail:ili@ili.ac.in Website:www.ilidelhi.org and www.ili.ac.in

---

**Cite this volume as 56 JILI (2014)**

---

The *Journal of the Indian Law Institute* is a quarterly publication. Papers for publication in this *Journal* are invited in the form of articles, notes and case comments. The paper must contain an abstract in not more than 150 words. The mode of citation and footnoting should be as followed in this Issue. Papers already published elsewhere will not be considered for publication in this *Journal*, Paper should be typed in double space on one side of the A-4 size paper and also sent in compact disc (CD) or as an attachment with e-mail at [ili@ili.ac.in](mailto:ili@ili.ac.in)

The Indian Law Institute shall be the sole copyright owner of all the published materials. Apart from fair dealing for the purposes of research, private study or criticism, no part of this *Journal* be copied, adapted, abridged, translated or stored in any retrieval system, computer system, photographic or other system or reproduced in any form by any means whether electronic, mechanical, digital, optical, photographic or otherwise without prior written permission from the Institute.

The editors, publishers and printers do not own any responsibility for the views expressed by the contributors and for the errors, if any, in the information contained in the *Journal* and author shall be solely responsible for the same.

---