

**F.C. 2.11**  
**1,000**



सत्यमेव जयते

# The Federal Court Reports

Containing cases determined by the Federal Court of India  
and by the Judicial Committee of the Privy  
Council on appeal from that Court.

1940—Vol. II

[1940] F.C.R.

Published, under the authority of the Supreme Court of India, by the  
Manager of Publications, Civil Lines, Delhi.

*All Rights Reserved.*

*Rs. 2/12/- or 4sh.-6d.*

# JUDGES

OF THE

## FEDERAL COURT

DURING THE PERIOD OF THESE REPORTS.

THE HON'BLE SIR MAURICE GWYER, *Chief Justice of India.*

THE HON'BLE SIR SHAH MUHAMMAD SULAIMAN.

THE HON'BLE SIR SRINIVASA VARADACHARIAR.

---

SIR BROJENDRA LAL MITTER, *Advocate-General of India.*

The mode of Citation of this the Second Volume of the Federal Court Reports, ending December 31st, 1940, will be as follows :—

[1940] F.C.R.

---

---

A TABLE  
OF THE  
**NAMES OF THE CASES REPORTED**  
IN THIS VOLUME

---

	PAGE
Ramnandan Prasad Narain Singh and Another <i>v.</i> Kulpati Shri Mahanth Goshwami Madh- wanand Ramji . . . . .	1
Jagdish Jha and Others <i>v.</i> Aman Khan . . . . .	7
Rani Brij Raj Kumari <i>v.</i> Subh Karan Das . . . . .	10
Kishori Lal <i>v.</i> Governor in Council, Punjab . . . . .	12
Hori Ram Singh <i>v.</i> The King Emperor [Privy Council] . . . . .	15
Lachmeshwar Prasad Shukul and Others <i>v.</i> Girdhari Lal Chaudhuri and Others . . . . .	17
Subhanand Chowdhary and Another <i>v.</i> Apurba Krishna Mitra and Another . . . . .	31
Surendra Prasad Narain Singh <i>v.</i> Sri Gajadhar Prasad Sahu Trust Estate and Others . . . . .	39

	PAGE
Jaigobind Singh and Others <i>v.</i> Lachmi Narain Ram and Others . . . . .	61
Birendra Prasad Sukul and Others <i>v.</i> Surendra Prasad Sukul and Others . . . . .	71
Raja Prithwi Chand Lall Choudhry <i>v.</i> Rai Bahadur Sukhraj Rai and Others . . . . .	75
Raja Prithwi Chand Lall Choudhry <i>v.</i> Rai Bahadur Sukhraj Rai and Others; Subhanand Chow- dhary and Another <i>v.</i> Apurba Krishna Mitra and Another . . . . .	78
Lachmeshwar Prasad Shukul and Others <i>v.</i> Keshwar Lal Chaudhuri and Others . . . . .	84
The United Provinces <i>v.</i> Mst. Atiqa Begum and Others . . . . .	110
A. L. S. P. P. L. Subrahmanyam Chettiar <i>v.</i> Muttu- swami Goundan <i>alias</i> Avanashi Goundan . . . . .	188

## TABLE OF CASES CITED

	PAGE
A.	
Att.-Gen. for Alberta <i>v.</i> Att.-Gen. for Canada.	[1939] A. C. 117 . . . . . 35
— for Alberta <i>v.</i> Kazakewich	[1937] Can. S. C. R. 427 . . . . . 129, 177
— for Canada <i>v.</i> Att.-Gen. for Ontario.	[1937] A. C. 355 . . . . . 159
— for British Columbia <i>v.</i> Att.-Gen. for Canada.	[1937] A. C. 368 . . . . . 160
— for British Columbia <i>v.</i> Att. Gen. for Canada.	[1937] A. C. 377 . . . . . 160, 222
— for Canada <i>v.</i> Att.-Gen. for British Columbia.	[1930] A. C. 111 . . . . . 201, 230, 237
— for Ontario <i>v.</i> Att.-Gen. for the Dominion of Canada.	[1894] A. C. 189 . . . . . 229
— <i>v.</i> Birmingham, Tame, and Rea District Drainage Board.	[1912] A. C. 788 . . . . . 94, 102, 104
— <i>v.</i> Brodic	(1846) 4 Moo. Ind. Ap. 190 . . . . . 170
— <i>v.</i> Cockermouth Local Board	(1874) L. R. 18 Eq. 172 . . . . . 171
— <i>v.</i> Logan	(1891) 2 Q. B. 100 . . . . . 171
— <i>v.</i> Wright	(1841) 3 Beav. 447 . . . . . 176
B.	
Bai Rukhiabai, <i>In re</i>	I. L. R. [1937] Bom. 425 . . . . . 176
Bank of Toronto <i>v.</i> Lambe	(1887) 12 App. Cas. 575 . . . . . 213
Beadling <i>v.</i> Goll	(1922) 39 T. L. R. 128 . . . . . 115, 164
Beauharnois L. H. & P. Co. <i>v.</i> Hydro-Electric Power Commission	[1937] 3 D. L. R. (Ont.) 458 . . . . . 128
Bholanath Pal, deceased, <i>In the goods of</i>	(1930) I. L. R. 58 Cal. 801 . . . . . 173, 184
Birendra Prasad Sukul <i>v.</i> Surendra Prasad Sukul	[1940] F. C. R. 71 . . . . . 84, 95, 105
Bishun Chand <i>v.</i> Girdhari Lal	(1934) I. L. R. 56 All. 376 ; A. I. R. 1934 P. C. 147 . . . . . 42, 49, 55
Board of Trustees of Lethbridge Irrigation District <i>v.</i> Independent Order of Foresters.	[1940] A. C. 513 . . . . . 196, 201, 223 230, 239
C.	
Chamberlain's Settlement, <i>In re</i>	[1921] 2 Ch. 533 . . . . . 172
Central Provinces and Berar Act No. XIV of 1938, <i>In re.</i>	[1939] F. C. R. 18 . . . . . 115, 161, 162, 193, 213, 235

	PAGE
Chethambaram Chettiar <i>v.</i> Loo Thon Poo . . . . .	(1940) I. M. L. J. 68 . . . . . 70
Citizens Insurance Company of Canada <i>v.</i> Parsons. . . . .	(1881) 7 App. Cas. . . . . 96, 201, 216, 236
Croft <i>v.</i> Dunphy . . . . .	[1933] A. C. 156 . . . . . 178
Colonial Sugar Refining Company <i>v.</i> Irving . . . . .	[1905] A. C. 369 . . . . . 165
D.	
Day <i>v.</i> Victoria . . . . .	(1938) 4 D. L. R. 345 . . . . . 195
E.	
Ellis <i>v.</i> Duke of Bedford . . . . .	[1899] 1 Ch. 494 . . . . . 172
Esquimalt and Nanaimo Railway Company <i>v.</i> Wilson. . . . .	[1920] A. C. 358 . . . . . 113, 127, 172
G.	
Gallagher <i>v.</i> Lynn . . . . .	[1937] A. C. 863 . . . . . 183, 195, 209, 237
Gastlaun <i>v.</i> Hutchison . . . . .	(1912) I. L. R. 39 Cal. 789 . . . . . 56
Goldar <i>v.</i> Saha . . . . .	(1905) 9 C. W. N. 584 . . . . . 175
Grand Trunk Railway of Canada <i>v.</i> Att.-Gen. of Canada. . . . .	[1907] A. C. 65 . . . . . 229
Great West Saddlery Co. <i>v.</i> The King . . . . .	[1921] 2 A. C. 91. . . . . 162, 201, 217, 239
H.	
Harachandra Das <i>v.</i> Bholanath Das . . . . .	(1935) I. L. R. 62 Cal. 701 . . . . . 175
Henshall <i>v.</i> Porter . . . . .	[1923] 2 K. B. 193 . . . . . 164
Hebbert <i>v.</i> Purchas . . . . .	(1871) L. R. 3 P. C. 664 . . . . . 81
Hodge <i>v.</i> The Queen . . . . .	(1883) 9 App. Cas. 117 . . . . . 178, 195
Hori Ram Singh <i>v.</i> The Crown . . . . .	[1939] F. C. R. 159 . . . . . 15
I.	
Initiative and Referendum Act, <i>In re</i> . . . . .	[1919] A. C. 935 . . . . . 222
J.	
Jagannath Prosad Singh Chowdhury <i>v.</i> Surajmul Jalal. . . . .	A. I. R. 1927 P. C. 1 . . . . . 67
Jagdish Jha <i>v.</i> Aman Khan . . . . .	[1940] F. C. R. 7. . . . . 42, 52, 67, 95
Jaigobind Singh <i>v.</i> Lachmi Narain Ram . . . . .	[1940] F. C. R. 61 . . . . . 53, 95, 230
Jaimala Kunwar <i>v.</i> Collector of Saharanpur . . . . .	(1933) I. L. R. 55 All. 825, . . . . . 112, 125 142, 169
Jan Mohomed <i>v.</i> Syed Nurudin . . . . .	(1907) I. L. R. 32 Bom. 155 . . . . . 176
John Deere Plow Co., Ltd. <i>v.</i> Wharton . . . . .	[1915] A. C. 330 . . . . . 129, 176, 195, 236

	PAGE
<b>K.</b>	
Kannakayya <i>v.</i> Janardhana Padhi . . . . .	(1910) I. L. R. 36 Mad. 439 . . . . . 10
Khajeh Solehman Quadir <i>v.</i> Salimullah Bahadur . . . . .	(1922) I. L. R. 49 Cal. 820 . . . . . 16
King, The <i>v.</i> Kidman . . . . .	(1915) 20 Com. L. R. 42. . . . . 178, 18
Kristnama Chariar <i>v.</i> Mangammal . . . . .	(1902) I. L. R. 26 Mad. 91 . . . . . 10
<b>L.</b>	
Lachmeshwar Prasad Shukul <i>v.</i> Girdhari Lal Chaudhuri . . . . .	[1940] F. C. R. 17 . . . . . 87
Lachmeshwar Prasad Shukul <i>v.</i> Keshwar Lal Chaudhuri . . . . .	[1940] F. C. R. 84 . . . . . 229
Ladore <i>v.</i> Bennett . . . . .	[1939] A. C. 468 . . . . . 196, 239
Lakhpat Ram <i>v.</i> Behari Lal Misir . . . . .	[1939] F. C. R. 121 . . . . . 12, 19
Lyle, B. S., <i>Ld. v.</i> Chappell . . . . .	[1932] 1 K. B. 691 . . . . . 61, 74
<b>M.</b>	
Macleod <i>v.</i> Att.-Gen. for New South Wales . . . . .	[1891] A. C. 455 . . . . . 238
Mada Nagaratnam <i>v.</i> Puvvada Seshayya . . . . .	(1939) I. M. L. J. 272; I. L. R. [1939] Mad. 151. . . . . 66, 190, 191
Madden <i>v.</i> Nelson and Fort Sheppard Railway . . . . .	[1899] A. C. 626 . . . . . 223
Marraige Legislation in Canada, <i>In re</i> . . . . .	[1912] A. C. 880 . . . . . 214, 216
Maruthamuthu Naicker <i>v.</i> Kadir Badsha Rowther . . . . .	I. L. R. [1938] Mad. 568 . . . . . 192
Minnesota <i>v.</i> National Tea Co. . . . .	(1940) 309 U. S. 551 . . . . . 87
Mohammad Akbar Khan <i>v.</i> Attar Singh . . . . .	(1936) I. L. R. 17 Lah. 557 . . . . . 57
Muhammad Abdul Qaiyum <i>v.</i> Secretary of State for India . . . . .	I. L. R. [1938] All. 114, 118, 139, 153, 157, 161, 167 . . . . .
Moon <i>v.</i> Durden . . . . .	(1848) 2 Ex. 22 . . . . . 115, 164, 185
Moser <i>v.</i> Marsden . . . . .	[1892] 1 Ch. 487 . . . . . 169, 170, 174
Mukherjee, K. C. <i>v.</i> Mst. Ram Ratan Kuer . . . . .	(1935) I. L. R. 15. Pat. 268; 63 Ind. Ap. . . . . 47, 93, 104, 117, 166, 186
<b>N.</b>	
Narain Das <i>v.</i> Miran Baksh . . . . .	A. I. R. 1925 Lah. . . . . 75, 42, 5, 5, 57
Nash <i>v.</i> Rochford Rural Council . . . . .	[1917] 1 K. B. 384 . . . . . 103
New Brunswick Railway Co. <i>v.</i> British and French Trust Corporation . . . . .	[1939] A. C. 1 . . . . . 87
<b>P.</b>	
Pachkauri Raut <i>v.</i> Ram Khilawan Chaube . . . . .	(1914) I. L. R. 37 All. 57 . . . . . 143
Patterson <i>v.</i> State of Alabama . . . . .	(1934) 294 U. S. 600 . . . . . 81
Phillips <i>v.</i> Eyre . . . . .	(1870) L. R. 6 Q. B. 1 . . . . . 178
Ponnamma <i>v.</i> Arumogam . . . . .	[1905] A. C. 383 . . . . . 103

		PAGE.
Queen, The <i>v.</i> Burah . . . . .	(1878) 3 App. Cas. 889. . . . .	133, 149, 178
Quilter <i>v.</i> Mapleson . . . . .	(1882) 9 Q. B. D. 672. 94, 102, 103, 104, 115, 117, 166	

## R.

Rajunder Narain Rae <i>v.</i> Bijai Govind Singh . . . . .	(1836) 1 Moo. P. C. 117 . . . . .	78, 80
Ramanandan Prasad Narain Singh <i>v.</i> Kulpati Shri Mahant Goshwami Madhwanand Ramji. }	[1940] F. C. R. 1 . . . . .	95, 224
Ram Singha <i>v.</i> Shankar Dayal . . . . .	(1928) I. L. R. 50 All. 965 . . . . .	115, 165
Rehmat-un-nissa Begam <i>v.</i> Price . . . . .	(1917) 45 Ind. Ap. 61 . . . . .	61, 65
Reid <i>v.</i> Reid . . . . .	(1886) 31 Ch. D. 402 . . . . .	185
Russell <i>v.</i> The Queen . . . . .	(1882) 7 App. Cas. 829. . . . .	159, 161, 201

## S.

Sadanand Jha <i>v.</i> Aman Khan . . . . .	(1938) I. L. R. 18 Pat. 13 . . . . .	8, 18, 32, 72
Sagarmal Marwari <i>v.</i> Bhuthu Ram . . . . .	(1940) 3 F. L. J., H. C. 119 ; A. I. R. 1941 Pat. 99 . . . . .	188, 195, 202, 235, 240
Secretary of State <i>v.</i> Murugesu Mudaliar . . . . .	A. I. R. 1929 Mad. 443. . . . .	113, 124, 169
Shannon <i>v.</i> Lower Mainland Dairy Products Board. }	[1938] A. C. 708 . . . . .	160, 209, 237
Shiam Lal, Joti Prasad <i>v.</i> Dhanpat Rai . . . . .	(1925) I. L. R. 47 All. 853 ; A. I. R. 1925 All. 768 . . . . .	142
Shyamakant Lal <i>v.</i> Rambhajan Singh . . . . .	[1939] F. C. R. 193. 1, 3, 5, 10, 11, 35, 43, 53, 84, 93, 94, 102, 166, 222	
Singheshwar Singh <i>v.</i> Medni Prasad Singh . . . . .	A. I. R. 1940 Pat. 65 . . . . .	58
Siqueira <i>v.</i> Noronha . . . . .	[1934] A. C. 332; A. I. R. 1934 P. C. 144 . . . . .	42, 49, 55
Smithies <i>v.</i> National Association of Operative Plasterers. }	[1909] 1 K. B. 310 . . . . .	115, 164
Sri Mahant Prayaga Doss <i>v.</i> Board of Commis- sioners for Hindu Religious Endowments, Madras. }	(1927) I. L. R. 50 Mad. 34. 112, 113, 124, 169, 174	
Srimantu Raja Yarlagaddu Durga <i>v.</i> Srimantu Mallikarjuna . . . . .	(1891) I. L. R. 14 Mad. 439 . . . . .	81
Sripat Singh <i>v.</i> Naresh Chandra Bose . . . . .	A. I. R. 1932 Pat. 332. . . . .	67
Subhanand Chowdhary <i>v.</i> Apurba Krishna Mitra . . . . .	[1940] F. C. R. 31 . . . . .	53, 68, 70, 82, 95, 102
Surendra Prasad Narain Singh <i>v.</i> Sri Gajadhar Prasad Sahu Trust Estate . . . . .	[1940] F. C. R. 39 . . . . .	62, 72, 95

## T.

Thistleton <i>v.</i> Frewer . . . . .	31 L. J. Ex. 230 . . . . .	164
Toronto Corporation <i>v.</i> York Corporation . . . . .	[1938] A. C. 415 . . . . .	195



## U.

Union Colliery Co. of British Columbia <i>v.</i> Bry-	} [1899] A. C. 580 . . . . .	201
den . . . . .		
United Provinces, The <i>v.</i> Atiqa Begum . . . . .	[1940] F. C. R. 110 . . . . .	209, 219

## V.

Venkata Narasimha Appa Row <i>v.</i> Court of	} (1886) 11 App. Cas. 660; 1 L. R.	78, 79, 82
Wards . . . . .		
Vishwanath Narayan Singh <i>v.</i> Sri Mahant	} (1938) I. L. R. 17 Pat. 714 . . . . .	3
Harihar Gir . . . . .		