
Table of Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xxiii</i>

CHAPTER 1

Introduction	1-10
I. Contextual Framework	1
II. Health Care at International Level	3
III. Public Participation in Health Care in Other Countries	6
IV. Legal Framework for Healthcare in India	6
V. Scope of Study	10

CHAPTER 2

Constitutional Protection to Health Care	11-25
I. The Law	11
II. Structure	13
III. Processes and Remedies	13
Right to Move the Supreme Court	13
Right to Move the High Court	14
IV. Key Questions	14
V. Experiences	14
Constitutional Right to Health Care	14
1. Constitutional Right to a Healthy Life	15
2. Recognition of Right to Health Care as a Fundamental Right	15

LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR HEALTH CARE IN INDIA

3. Professional Obligation to Protect Accident Victims	15
4. No Harrasment of Doctors	17
4. Duty of Doctor to Examine Rape Victim	18
5. Workers Right to Health Care Facilities	18
6. Health Care Rights of Convicts and Undertrials	20
7. Guidelines for Holding Medical Camps	20
8. Role of Legal Aid and Advice Boards	22
9. Right to Health Care and Privacy of AIDS patient	22
10. Implementation of International Standards	24
VI. Conclusion & Suggestions	24

CHAPTER 3

Liability of Health Professionals under the Law of Torts	26-54
I. The Common Law Principles & Judicial Decisions	26
1. Definition of Negligence under Law of Torts	26
2. Negligence in conducting Family Planning	32
3. Principles Determining Tortious Liability	33
(i) Test of Reasonable Foresight	33
(jj) Duty to Care	34
(iii) Standard of Care	34
(iv) Loss of Injury Necessary	34
4. Professional Negligence	35
(i) Definition of Professional	35
(ii) Test to Prove Negligence	36
II. Structure	36
III. Processes.....	37
Free Legal Aid and Advice	37
IV. Key Questions	37
V. Experiences	39
1. Duties of Doctor towards the Patient	39
2. Extent of Liability for Ignorance	39
3. Liability of Quacks	40
4. Responsibility of Health Department for Elimination of "Quacks"	41
5. Civil Liability of Hospitals/Doctors for Negligence	42
(i) Degree of Negligence	42
(ii) Liability of Doctor on his Death	42
(iii) Liability of Doctor for Error of Judgement	42
(iv) Level of Competence Expected of a Doctor	43

TABLE OF CONTENTS

6. Concept of Duty to Take Care	43
7. Standard of Care: Location Factor	44
(i) Treatment Differ from Doctor to Doctor	44
(ii) Liability of Doctor for not Advising Patient	44
(iii) Difference in Standard of Care of Doctors	44
8. Duty to Take Care in Accident Cases	45
9. Role of Consent in Fixing Liability	45
(i) Oral Consent Admissibility	45
(ii) Necessity of Obtaining Consent Before Operation	45
10. Liability of Government/Private Hospitals	46
(i) Liability of Government Hospitals/Doctors.....	46
(ii) Vicarious Liability of Government for Acts of its Servants	47
(iii) Vicarious Liability of Owner of Hospital	47
11. <i>Res Ipsa Loquitur</i>	48
Principles for Applicability of the Doctrine	48
12. Medical Confidentiality	51
Liability of Doctor for Violating Confidentiality	51
13. Burden of Proof	51
14. Award of Compensation	51
(i) Principles for Determining Quantum of Damages	51
(ii) Award of Compensation Based on Age and Salary of Deceased	52
(iii) Enhancement of Claims.....	53
VI. Conclusion & Suggestions	53

CHAPTER 4

Criminal Liability of Health Provider	55-71
I. Legal Provisions Concerning Health Care and Protection under the IPC, 1860	55
II. Procedure under the Cr PC 1973	59
III. Structure	61
IV. Processes	61
V. Key Questions	62
VI. Experiences	62

LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR HEALTH CARE IN INDIA

1. General Liability of Medical Practitioners	62
2. The Role of Consent	63
3. Role of Criminal/Undertrial to Health Care	66
4. Liability of Prescribing Poisonous Medicines	66
5. Administering Wrong Injection	67
6. Operation Conducted by <i>Kabiraj</i>	68
7. <i>Hakim</i> Administering Penicillin Treatment	69
8. Determination of Criminal Liability	69
9. Doctor's Responsibility of Provide Medical Aid	70
VII. Conclusion & Suggestions	70

CHAPTER 5

Regulation of Health Professional Through Professional Bodies	72-92
--	-------

I. Introduction	72
1, Indian Medical Council Act, 1956	72
(a) Right of Persons Possessing Qualifications In the Schedules to be Enrolled	73
(b) Professional Conduct	73
(c) Indian Medical Register	74
(d) Removal of Names from the Register	74
A. Code of Medical Ethics	75
(i) Physicians Responsibility	75
(ii) Duties of Physician to the Patient	75
(a) Obligation to the Sick	75
(b) Patience, Delicacy and Secrecy	75
(c) Prognosis	75
(d) The Patient must not be Neglected	76
(iii) Duties of Physician in Consultation	76
(a) Consultation should be Encouraged	76
(b) Consultations for Patient Benefit	76
(c) Punctuality in Consultation	76
(d) Conduct in Consultation	76
(e) Statement to Patient after Consultation	77
(f) Treatment after Consultation	77
(g) Consultant not to Take Charge of Case	77
(h) Patients Referred to Specialists	77
(i) Provisions for Taking Disciplinary Action under the Code of Medical Ethics	77

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(iv) Liability of Doctor for Lack of Post-operative Care	78
(a) Applicability of Code of Criminal Ethics	78
(b) Timely Warning to Patients' Family	78
(c) Refusal to Attend to a Patient	78
(d) Warning Notice	79
(e) Severe Negligence	79
B. Code of Ethics Formulated by State Councils	79
2. Indian Medicine Central Council Act 1970	80
3. Dentists Act 1948	81
4. The Pharmacy Act 1948	81
5. The Indian Nursing Council Act 1947	82
6. The Homeopathy Central Council Act 1973	83
II. Structure of National & State Medical Councils	84
III. Processes	84
1. Machinery at the National Level	84
2. Machinery at the State Level	85
3. Machinery at the District Level	85
IV. Key Questions	85
V. Experiences	85
1. Homeopath Practicing Allopathic Medicine	85
2. Liability of Medical Professionals	87
3. Medical Professionals under the CPA	87
4. Medical Council's Jurisdiction to Award Compensation	88
5. Inaction of Medical Association Deprecated	89
6. Liability for Violating Confidentiality	89
7. Role of Magistrates and Medical Officers in Elimination of Unauthorised Medical Practitioners	89
VI. Conclusion & Suggestions	89

CHAPTER 6

Liability of Health Professionals under the Consumer Protection Act 1986	93-152
I. Legal Provisions	93
1. Need to Enact Consumer Legislation	93
2. Important Legal Provisions Concerning Liability of Health Professionals	95
Who can File a Complaint	95
How to File a Complaint	95

LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR HEALTH CARE IN INDIA

	Contents of the Complaint	95
	What Constitutes a Complaint	95
	Time Limit for Filing a Complaint	96
	Procedure for Filing the Appeal	96
	Who is a Consumer	96
	Consumer Dispute	97
	Defect	97
	Deficiency	97
	Service	97
II.	Structure	97
III.	Processes	98
	1. Procedure for Filing the Complaints	98
	2. Where to File a Complaint	98
	(i) District Forum	98
	(ii) State Commission	98
	(iii) National Commission	98
	3. Time Limit for Deciding Complaints	99
	4. Finality of Orders	99
	5. Appeal to Supreme Court	99
	6. Consequences of Filing Frivolous Complaints	99
IV.	Key Questions	99
V.	Experiences	100
	1. Indian Medical Association Case	100
	2. Right of Legal Representative to File a Complaint	103
	3. Place of Filing the Complaint	104
	4. Jurisdictional Aspects	104
	(i) Jurisdiction to Award Compensation to a Minor Child	104
	(ii) Jurisdiction to Decide Charging of Fees	104
	(iii) No Jurisdiction to Decide Intricate Issues	104
	(iv) Necessity of Expert Evidence	107
	5. Maintainability of Complaint During the Proceedings of a Criminal Complaint	107
	6. Standard of Proof	107
	7. Condoning Delay	108
	Complaint Barred by Limitation	108
	8. Service	108
	(i) Meaning of Service	108
	(ii) Status of Government Servant Availing Free Services	110
	(iii) Status of Relative Availing Free Services	110

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(iv)	Concept of Hire/Service	110
(v)	Paramedical Services under the Purview of CPA	110
(vi)	Liability of Private Hospitals/Nursing Homes	111
9.	Exceptions to 'Service'	111
(i)	Government Hospitals	111
(a)	CGHS does not Fall under the Purview of the Consumer Protection Act	111
(b)	Government Servant Availing Free Services	111
(c)	Payment of Token Amount for Registration	112
(d)	No Liability of Government Hospitals and Staff	112
(e)	Railway Hospital Not Covered under the CPA	113
(ii)	Charitable Hospital or Hospital Doing Philanthropic Services	114
	Student Availing Services	114
10.	Deficiency of Services	114
(i)	Who Can Make a Complaint for Deficiency of Service	114
(ii)	Giving False Certificate Amounts to Deficiency	115
11.	When There is No Deficiency of Service	115
(i)	Relevance of Expert Evidence to Prove Deficiency of Service	115
(ii)	Departmental Enquiry Prove No Deficiency in Service	116
12.	Duty of Care	116
	Duty of Doctor to Save the Patient	117
13.	Standard of Care	117
(i)	Level of Skill-Not the Highest Degree of Skill	117
(ii)	Whether Standard of care Differ from Village Hospitals to City Hospitals	118
14.	Negligence	118
(i)	Distinction between Medical Negligence under the Consumer Law and the Law of Torts	118

LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR HEALTH CARE IN INDIA

(ii)	The Concept of Negligence	119
(iii)	Determination of Negligence	120
(iv)	Burden of Proof in Cases of Negligence	120
(v)	Acts Amounting to Negligence	121
(a)	Homoeopath Practicing Allopathic Medicine	121
(b)	Liability of Pharmacist for Prescribing Medicines	121
(c)	Liability of Doctor for Lack of Post-operative Care	122
(d)	Absence of Doctor and Duty of Care	122
(e)	Treatment by Mid-wife Causing Rupture of Uterus	122
(f)	Paralysis in Newborn Baby During Surgery	123
(g)	Wrong Injection Leading to Paralysis of Leg	123
(h)	Loss of Vision due to Putting of Acid Drops	123
(i)	Liability of Doctor for Wrong Diagnosis	123
(j)	Negligence of Nursing Home in Shifting of Patient	124
(k)	Liability of Anaesthetist	124
15.	What Acts Do Not Amount to Negligence	124
(i)	Negligence should be Apparent	124
(ii)	Negligence on the Part of the Patient	124
(iii)	Examination of Pregnant Woman by Nurse	124
(iv)	Eye Surgery : Effects of Concealment of Material Facts by Complainant	126
(v)	Delay in Treating Patient	126
(vi)	Liability of Doctor for Conducting Bypass Surgery on Diabetic Patient	126
(vii)	Blood Transfusion of Other Group	127
(viii)	Failure to Prove Blood Transfusion Infected with Hepatitis	127
(ix)	Liability of Doctor for Adopting Conservative Method of Treatment	128
(x)	Eye Surgery for the Second Time: Liability	129
(xi)	Attempt to Deliver the Child by Forceps	129

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(xii)	Post-mortem Report Gives No Opinion Regarding Cause of Death	129
(xiii)	Impotency Not Due to Operation	130
(xiv)	Caesarean Operation Along with Sterilisation Operation without Obtaining Consent	130
(xv)	Non-removal of Kidney Stone while Operating a Urinary Bladder Not Negligence	131
(xvi)	Bare Allegations Not Acceptable	131
(xvii)	No Medical Expert Produced, No Negligence and Deficiency of Service	131
(xviii)	Liability of Doctors for Not Accommodating Patient in ICU During Post-operation	132
16.	Vicarious Liability	133
(i)	Liability of Hospital for the Acts of Employees	133
(ii)	Surgeon's Liability for the Acts of Anaesthetist	133
(iii)	Medical Superintendent's Liability for the Acts of the Staff	133
17.	Unfair Trade Practices	134
18.	Fee for Operation includes Post-operative Care	135
19.	Compensation	135
	Factors Required to be Taken into Consideration While Awarding Compensation	136
(a)	General	136
(b)	Compensation Cannot be Estimated in Terms of Monetary Compensation	137
(c)	Age of Complainant and his Gross Salary	137
(d)	Employability and Life Expectancy Test	137
(e)	Application of Principles Applied in Motor Accident Claim Cases in Consumer Protection Cases	138
(f)	Financial Status of the Doctor	139
(g)	Award of General Damages	139
(h)	Quantum of Compensation	140
(i)	Compensation for Causing Mental Agony	140
(j)	Treatment by Midwife	140

LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR HEALTH CARE IN INDIA

(k)	Claim for Compensation and Medical Reimbursement for Defective Denture	141
(l)	Issuance of Incomplete and False Certificate	141
(m)	Award of Gratia Amount on Humanitarian Grounds	141
(n)	No Compensation in Time-barred Cases	141
20.	Problems & Prospects	142
(i)	Duty of Doctor to Take Care and Record Clinical History of Patient	142
(ii)	Duty of Doctor to Inform the Family Members	143
(iii)	Doctor's Right to Decide, Prioritise the Patient for Examination	143
(iv)	Non-availability of Life Saving Drugs	143
(v)	Professional Impropriety and Dishonesty	143
(vi)	Difficulty in Proving Negligence	144
(vii)	Connection Between Treatment and Subsequent Death Not Proved	144
(viii)	Allegation of Wrong Surgery	145
(ix)	Second Surgery Doctors Differ	146
(x)	Discharge of Patient Against Medical Advice	146
(xi)	Wrong Diagnosis Not Negligence	146
(xii)	Failure to Admit a Patient to ICU due to Non-availability of Beds	146
(xiii)	Failure to Prove Sponge or Swab in the Abdomen	147
(xiv)	Absence of Proof of Negligence	147
(xv)	Trauma Management	148
(xvi)	Frivolous Complaint Against Doctor/Hospital Imposition of Costs	148
(xvi)	Imposition of Costs in Frivolous Cases	150
VI.	Conclusion & Suggestions	150

CHAPTER 7

Liability of Health Professionals under the Law of Contract	153-158
I. Legal Provisions	153
II. Structure	155

TABLE OF CONTENTS

III.	Processes	155
IV.	Key Questions	156
V.	Experiences	156
	1. Doctor's Right to Collect the Charges	156
	2. Liability of Doctors under the Contract Act	156
	3. Liability of Hospitals for the Acts of its Doctors	157
	4. Who is an Agent/Servant/Employee	157
	5. Liability of Doctors for Breach of Duty	157
VII.	Conclusion & Suggestions	158

CHAPTER 8

Conclusion & Suggestions	159-172
1. Statutory Obligations to Provide Healthcare	159
2. Employers Obligation to Provide Health Services During and After Employment	159
3. Obligation of Hospitals to provide Medical Assistance in Emergency Cases	160
4. Duty of a Doctor to provide Medical Aid in Trauma and Medico-Legal Cases	160
5. Post-operative Care	161
6. Duty of a Doctor to Maintain and Provide Medical Records	162
7. Advertising of Medical Services Provided by Doctors	162
8. Treatment of a Patient During Medical Camps	162
9. Medical Facilities in Villages	163
10. Doctors Duty in Treating HIV/AIDS Patients	163
11. Professional Responsibility and Degree of Care	164
12. Burden of Proof in Non-performance of Surgery or Non-administration of Medicine	164
13. Penal Liability	165
14. Role of Medical Councils	166
15. Elimination of Quacks	167
16. Guidelines to be Observed by Hospitals etc.	168
17. Liability under the Consumer Protection Act	169
18. Assistance of Medical Experts	169
19. False and Frivolous Cases	170
20. Delay in Disposal of Cases	170
21. Difficulty in Proving Medical Negligence Cases	170
22. Liability under the Contract Act	171

LEGAL FRAMEWORK FOR HEALTH CARE IN INDIA

23. Role of the Government	171
24. Public Participation in Health Care	171
25. Role of Legal Aid and Advice Boards	171
26. Enactment of the Patients Rights Act	172
APPENDIX	173-311
1. Indian Medical Council Act, 1956	175
2. Code of Medical Ethics	188
3. The Consumer Protection Act, 1986	199
4. The Consumer Protection Rules, 1987	218
5. Medical Termination of Pregnancy Act, 1971	226
6. The Pre-natal Diagnostic Techniques (Regulation and Prevention of Misuse) Act, 1994	230
7. The Mental Health Act, 1987	245
8. The Fatal Accidents Act, 1855	257
9. The Indian Majority Act, 1875	259
10. The Legal Representatives' Suits Act, 1855	260
11. Health Care Rights of Employees under Various Legislations	261
(i) The Factories Act, 1948	261
(ii) The Employees State Insurance Act, 1948	261
(iii) The Dangerous Machines (Regulation) Act, 1983	262
(iv) The Dock Workers (Safety, Welfare and Health) Act, 1986	262
12. Health Care Rights of Persons with Disabilities	263
A. International Legal Protection to the Persons with Disabilities	263
B. Legal Protection at the National Level	263
(i) Mental Health Act, 1987	264
(ii) Rehabilitation Council of India Act, 1992	264
(iii) Persons with Disabilities (Equal opportunities, Protection of Rights and Full Participation) Act, 1995	264
Redressal of Grievances of Persons with Disabilities	265
(iv) The National Trust for Welfare of Persons with Autism, Cerebral Palsy,	

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Mental Retardation and Multiple	
	Disabilities Act, 1999	265
13.	Health Rights of Prisoners	266
	International Protection	266
	National Protection (The Prisons Act, 1894)	268
14.	Emerging Issues	270
	(i) The Transplantation of Human	
	Organs Act, 1994	270
	(ii) The Delhi Artificial Insemination	
	(Human) Act, 1995	274
	(iii) The Consumer Protection (Amendment)	
	Bill, 2001	276

